

- Physicalism is “proved” by inductive evidence, leading to inference to the best explanation.

1
00:00:05,240 --> 00:00:01,969
this is pared away the things that we

2
00:00:08,480 --> 00:00:05,250
thought were mental about the mind and

3
00:00:10,669 --> 00:00:08,490
assigned it to the physical and in a

4
00:00:12,440 --> 00:00:10,679
sense the issue of consciousness the

5
00:00:15,650 --> 00:00:12,450
question of consciousness is all that's

6
00:00:18,290 --> 00:00:15,660
left in the mind versus brain battle ok

7
00:00:21,290 --> 00:00:18,300
so the threat consciousness is the

8
00:00:25,009 --> 00:00:21,300
threat to mind itself as distinct entity

9
00:00:29,029 --> 00:00:25,019
mind as mind rather than mind as some

10
00:00:31,759 --> 00:00:29,039
physical product so let's talk about

11
00:00:34,910 --> 00:00:31,769
physicalism which is at root the premise

12
00:00:36,290 --> 00:00:34,920
that the mind just is the brain ok here

13
00:00:38,630 --> 00:00:36,300

here are the premises of physicalism

14

00:00:42,860 --> 00:00:38,640

only physical forces and states are

15

00:00:45,020 --> 00:00:42,870

causative all aspects of mind are the

16

00:00:49,610 --> 00:00:45,030

result of underlying physical processes

17

00:00:51,950 --> 00:00:49,620

and there isn't anything in the universe

18

00:00:53,840 --> 00:00:51,960

that isn't a consequence of matter or

19

00:00:57,049 --> 00:00:53,850

energy or some combination of the two

20

00:00:59,299 --> 00:00:57,059

and if there was something that was not

21

00:01:01,310 --> 00:00:59,309

a consequence of matter or energy it

22

00:01:02,720 --> 00:01:01,320

wouldn't matter at all to the physical

23

00:01:04,700 --> 00:01:02,730

universe it would be irrelevant to it

24

00:01:06,800 --> 00:01:04,710

that's for you those of you who like

25

00:01:09,859 --> 00:01:06,810

very long words with lots of syllables

26
00:01:14,840 --> 00:01:09,869
that's called the EPPA phenomenal ism

27
00:01:16,940 --> 00:01:14,850
that that's the premise there ok so

28
00:01:20,200 --> 00:01:16,950
according to physical isn't mind and

29
00:01:25,130 --> 00:01:20,210
therefore by extension consciousness is

30
00:01:28,670 --> 00:01:25,140
physical and only physical ok this poses

31
00:01:32,240 --> 00:01:28,680
some problems for us ok first off death

32
00:01:36,050 --> 00:01:32,250
survival if everything about human

33
00:01:38,179 --> 00:01:36,060
nature is only physical then forget

34
00:01:40,670 --> 00:01:38,189
about death survival there's no there's

35
00:01:42,200 --> 00:01:40,680
no substance to that and this is why you

36
00:01:44,210 --> 00:01:42,210
run into when you talk to mainstream

37
00:01:47,440 --> 00:01:44,220
scientists and skeptics who are very

38
00:01:50,179 --> 00:01:47,450

much subscribers to the physicalist

39

00:01:51,980 --> 00:01:50,189

thesis that's why they dismiss the idea

40

00:01:53,929 --> 00:01:51,990

of death survival or any of these kind

41

00:01:57,289 --> 00:01:53,939

of things is because if physically

42

00:01:58,999 --> 00:01:57,299

physicalism is true then you don't

43

00:02:00,859 --> 00:01:59,009

survive death nor are there any

44

00:02:03,109 --> 00:02:00,869

spiritual component seeing universe any

45

00:02:04,789 --> 00:02:03,119

sorts of spiritual experiences at least

46

00:02:08,419 --> 00:02:04,799

in the terms that has traditionally been

47

00:02:11,479 --> 00:02:08,429

regarded as that all religious claims

48

00:02:13,309 --> 00:02:11,489

are bankrupt except those that deal only

49

00:02:16,970 --> 00:02:13,319

with sociology or psychology

50

00:02:20,899 --> 00:02:16,980

and perhaps most importantly free will

51
00:02:23,059 --> 00:02:20,909
is then succumbs to determinism and in

52
00:02:25,729 --> 00:02:23,069
determinism if you if physicalism is

53
00:02:28,099 --> 00:02:25,739
true there's a growing consensus you

54
00:02:30,199 --> 00:02:28,109
lose free will in any robust sense of

55
00:02:35,629 --> 00:02:30,209
that term so you see these are pretty

56
00:02:38,030 --> 00:02:35,639
major implications for individual and

57
00:02:41,420 --> 00:02:38,040
for society at large so physicalism true

58
00:02:43,190 --> 00:02:41,430
physicalism is true it can catch it will

59
00:02:46,869 --> 00:02:43,200
change things dramatically it already

60
00:02:50,629 --> 00:02:46,879
has started to do that okay however

61
00:02:53,030 --> 00:02:50,639
excuse me consciousness itself is used

62
00:02:54,589 --> 00:02:53,040
as an argument against physicalism it

63
00:02:56,089 --> 00:02:54,599

sounds a little bit circular right

64

00:02:58,459 --> 00:02:56,099

physical isms trying to prove the

65

00:03:00,020 --> 00:02:58,469

consciousness is physical but

66

00:03:02,030 --> 00:03:00,030

consciousness itself is using to rebut

67

00:03:04,339 --> 00:03:02,040

that argument okay it's not as circular

68

00:03:06,979 --> 00:03:04,349

as it sounds but it is actually in vain

69

00:03:09,020 --> 00:03:06,989

is off explain here okay a number of our

70

00:03:10,429 --> 00:03:09,030

of interesting arguments and thought

71

00:03:12,890 --> 00:03:10,439

experiments have been used to try and

72

00:03:15,470 --> 00:03:12,900

show that consciousness is consciousness

73

00:03:16,849 --> 00:03:15,480

is not physical at least in any sense

74

00:03:18,409 --> 00:03:16,859

that the physicalist would like it to be

75

00:03:19,759 --> 00:03:18,419

I'm not going to explain all these

76

00:03:21,020 --> 00:03:19,769

arguments we don't have enough time but

77

00:03:24,890 --> 00:03:21,030

there are many interesting ones they're

78

00:03:26,360 --> 00:03:24,900

very colorfully entitled you got Mary

79

00:03:28,580 --> 00:03:26,370

the color scientist the knowledge

80

00:03:30,439 --> 00:03:28,590

argument I already talked about what it

81

00:03:32,420 --> 00:03:30,449

is like to be a bat there's the zombie

82

00:03:34,819 --> 00:03:32,430

argument and there's the inverted

83

00:03:36,409 --> 00:03:34,829

spectrum argument and perhaps in the QA

84

00:03:38,509 --> 00:03:36,419

or sometime after you're not familiar

85

00:03:39,890 --> 00:03:38,519

with these arguments I can I can touch

86

00:03:42,020 --> 00:03:39,900

on them for you for a minute but all of

87

00:03:45,159 --> 00:03:42,030

these are used to show through various

88

00:03:48,409 --> 00:03:45,169

clever argumentation methods that

89

00:03:49,610 --> 00:03:48,419

consciousness is non-physical okay or at

90

00:03:52,069 --> 00:03:49,620

least that it's an argument against

91

00:03:53,800 --> 00:03:52,079

physicalism unfortunately they don't

92

00:03:56,689 --> 00:03:53,810

succeed and i'll explain white

93

00:03:58,159 --> 00:03:56,699

physicalism strikes back in order to

94

00:04:00,589 --> 00:03:58,169

understand how strikes back let's talk

95

00:04:02,479 --> 00:04:00,599

about how we establish the truth of

96

00:04:05,479 --> 00:04:02,489

physicalism in the first place first of

97

00:04:07,699 --> 00:04:05,489

all physicalism is proved by inductive

98

00:04:09,729 --> 00:04:07,709

evidence okay leading to what's known as

99

00:04:13,969 --> 00:04:09,739

inference to the best explanation

100

00:04:16,939 --> 00:04:13,979

physicalism is not a deduced proposition

101

00:04:20,060 --> 00:04:16,949

it is not proved like math like a math

102

00:04:21,469 --> 00:04:20,070

problem it has proved and in fact you

103

00:04:22,909 --> 00:04:21,479

can throw out the word prove because

104

00:04:25,129 --> 00:04:22,919

really when you get right down to it

105

00:04:26,750 --> 00:04:25,139

science doesn't deal improve science

106

00:04:30,200 --> 00:04:26,760

deals in preponderance

107

00:04:32,870 --> 00:04:30,210

evidence and so the better your evidence

108

00:04:34,640 --> 00:04:32,880

the more likely or your theory is to be

109

00:04:39,920 --> 00:04:34,650

true and that's basically how

110

00:04:42,020 --> 00:04:39,930

physicalism is established ok so in

111

00:04:43,460 --> 00:04:42,030

involves a new word of induction so if

112

00:04:45,350 --> 00:04:43,470

you have one crow and then you find

113

00:04:47,750 --> 00:04:45,360

another CRO and they're black and you

114

00:04:48,920 --> 00:04:47,760

find another crow in its black and then

115

00:04:50,480 --> 00:04:48,930

you find another crew on its black

116

00:04:52,130 --> 00:04:50,490

eventually you conclude that any blank

117

00:04:54,650 --> 00:04:52,140

row you're going to encounter is black

118

00:04:58,580 --> 00:04:54,660

right that's completely familiar at all

119

00:05:01,010 --> 00:04:58,590

all right and how this argument works

120

00:05:04,880 --> 00:05:01,020

out with physicalism and science in

121

00:05:06,440 --> 00:05:04,890

general is that any time we encounter a

122

00:05:09,740 --> 00:05:06,450

phenomenon that we think is supernatural

123

00:05:11,030 --> 00:05:09,750

when we investigate very thoroughly we

124

00:05:12,590 --> 00:05:11,040

discover that there are physical

125

00:05:14,540 --> 00:05:12,600

explanations that are far better than

126

00:05:16,730 --> 00:05:14,550

any supernatural explanations so for

127

00:05:18,890 --> 00:05:16,740

example we have this view that disease

128

00:05:20,090 --> 00:05:18,900

is caused by evil demons then enter a

129

00:05:21,980 --> 00:05:20,100

person's body and then the witch doctor

130

00:05:23,660 --> 00:05:21,990

comes and shakes his rattle and blow

131

00:05:26,150 --> 00:05:23,670

some smoke and it chases the demons out

132

00:05:28,640 --> 00:05:26,160

and the person is cured but if you get a

133

00:05:30,350 --> 00:05:28,650

stub or demon they die okay so you all

134

00:05:32,840 --> 00:05:30,360

bets are off the witch doctor does is

135

00:05:34,850 --> 00:05:32,850

best okay well then later on the germ

136

00:05:36,470 --> 00:05:34,860

theory comes along discovers that no

137

00:05:37,700 --> 00:05:36,480

diseases are caused by little tiny

138

00:05:38,990 --> 00:05:37,710

things to get into the body and there

139

00:05:41,570 --> 00:05:39,000

are these things you can do to combat

140

00:05:44,090 --> 00:05:41,580

those terms and in fact your cure rate

141

00:05:46,790 --> 00:05:44,100

goes up dramatically that's evidence

142

00:05:49,250 --> 00:05:46,800

very strong evidence that the evil

143

00:05:51,830 --> 00:05:49,260

demons supernatural hypothesis is false

144

00:05:55,100 --> 00:05:51,840

and that you have a physical explanation

145

00:05:57,530 --> 00:05:55,110

that works very well okay so you have

146

00:05:58,580 --> 00:05:57,540

this hypothesis that angels are pushing

147

00:06:00,880 --> 00:05:58,590

the planets around and that's what

148

00:06:03,230 --> 00:06:00,890

causes the movement of the planets well

149

00:06:04,850 --> 00:06:03,240

later on Copernicus and Kepler and

150

00:06:06,380 --> 00:06:04,860

Newton come along and we discover that

151
00:06:08,630 --> 00:06:06,390
no you can explain the movement of the

152
00:06:10,970 --> 00:06:08,640
planets by very plausible physical

153
00:06:13,580 --> 00:06:10,980
mechanisms we don't need angels anymore

154
00:06:15,830 --> 00:06:13,590
okay so you've established two cases

155
00:06:17,420 --> 00:06:15,840
where a physical explanation is far

156
00:06:19,070 --> 00:06:17,430
better than a supernatural explanation

157
00:06:21,170 --> 00:06:19,080
and after you've done dozens of those

158
00:06:22,730 --> 00:06:21,180
and hundreds and thousands of those you

159
00:06:25,280 --> 00:06:22,740
come to the conclusion through inference

160
00:06:28,430 --> 00:06:25,290
to the best explanation that any time

161
00:06:30,170 --> 00:06:28,440
you encounter a supernatural explanation

162
00:06:32,180 --> 00:06:30,180
for a phenomenon that happens here in

163
00:06:33,950 --> 00:06:32,190

the physical world there's probably

164

00:06:35,450 --> 00:06:33,960

going to be a physical explanation for

165

00:06:37,790 --> 00:06:35,460

it so you can forget the supernatural

166

00:06:40,100 --> 00:06:37,800

explanation that's kind of how it works

167

00:06:43,320 --> 00:06:40,110

okay everybody clear on

168

00:06:44,850 --> 00:06:43,330

okay hmm so you get an induction and you

169

00:06:46,710 --> 00:06:44,860

get inference to the best explanation I

170

00:06:49,470 --> 00:06:46,720

couldn't couldn't resist putting in this

171

00:06:53,400 --> 00:06:49,480

word in parentheses abduction it's not

172

00:06:54,990 --> 00:06:53,410

what you're thinking okay abduction

173

00:06:56,750 --> 00:06:55,000

actually refers to the logical principle

174

00:06:59,250 --> 00:06:56,760

of inference to the best explanation

175

00:07:03,390 --> 00:06:59,260

among other things of course but that's

176

00:07:05,700 --> 00:07:03,400

what it means here Hey so because

177

00:07:07,860 --> 00:07:05,710

physicalism is proved by inductive

178

00:07:12,410 --> 00:07:07,870

evidence through empirical research

179

00:07:15,930 --> 00:07:12,420

right logical and deductive arguments

180

00:07:18,540 --> 00:07:15,940

can't disprove it and so often eyes

181

00:07:19,800 --> 00:07:18,550

people launch philosophical arguments

182

00:07:21,990 --> 00:07:19,810

against physicalism and they just don't

183

00:07:24,450 --> 00:07:22,000

go anywhere because they don't get it

184

00:07:27,660 --> 00:07:24,460

what actually grounds physicalism the

185

00:07:28,890 --> 00:07:27,670

only way to deal with if you so how do

186

00:07:30,450 --> 00:07:28,900

you how do you deal with the how do you

187

00:07:33,210 --> 00:07:30,460

fight physicalism the only way to do

188

00:07:35,930 --> 00:07:33,220

that is with a counterexample so-called

189

00:07:38,010 --> 00:07:35,940

white crow everybody's heard this term

190

00:07:39,540 --> 00:07:38,020

everybody thinks it came from what well

191

00:07:40,800 --> 00:07:39,550

the different people thing comes for

192

00:07:43,020 --> 00:07:40,810

different people but as far as I can

193

00:07:45,000 --> 00:07:43,030

tell it originated with William James

194

00:07:47,520 --> 00:07:45,010

he's when the first used the term white

195

00:07:52,860 --> 00:07:47,530

crow and he was referring to refuting in

196

00:07:55,380 --> 00:07:52,870

a enumerative induction the only way to

197

00:07:56,940 --> 00:07:55,390

do it is with a counterexample okay so

198

00:07:58,680 --> 00:07:56,950

here we have all these crows and they're

199

00:08:00,360 --> 00:07:58,690

all black well what happens if we find a

200

00:08:03,750 --> 00:08:00,370

white crow well we disproved our

201

00:08:07,080 --> 00:08:03,760

induction but it doesn't work quite so

202

00:08:09,210 --> 00:08:07,090

easily that way in modern science one

203

00:08:14,870 --> 00:08:09,220

white crow isn't enough real quick why

204

00:08:16,920 --> 00:08:14,880

isn't one white crow enough huh

205

00:08:19,550 --> 00:08:16,930

replication right it could be an

206

00:08:21,600 --> 00:08:19,560

accident maybe that crow flew through a

207

00:08:24,420 --> 00:08:21,610

radiation stream you know or whatever

208

00:08:27,630 --> 00:08:24,430

got mutated who knows right you got to

209

00:08:30,210 --> 00:08:27,640

have more than one white crow in science

210

00:08:33,990 --> 00:08:30,220

to establish whether or not an induction

211

00:08:35,580 --> 00:08:34,000

is falsified or not ok so the

212

00:08:37,709 --> 00:08:35,590

unfortunate thing is sources of white

213

00:08:40,140 --> 00:08:37,719

crows have dried up with air every time

214

00:08:42,000 --> 00:08:40,150

you disprove a supernatural hypothesis

215

00:08:43,800 --> 00:08:42,010

you have disparate now i'm using

216

00:08:47,010 --> 00:08:43,810

supernatural very globally here a

217

00:08:49,100 --> 00:08:47,020

non-physical hypothesis if you will then

218

00:08:52,560 --> 00:08:49,110

you have lost one of your white crows

219

00:08:53,759 --> 00:08:52,570

which is why the qualia what it's like

220

00:08:55,079 --> 00:08:53,769

knowledge arguments

221

00:08:59,280 --> 00:08:55,089

why all the arguments from consciousness

222

00:09:00,689 --> 00:08:59,290

don't work is because although well and

223

00:09:02,939 --> 00:09:00,699

see if I guess this is where I can talk

224

00:09:06,030 --> 00:09:02,949

about this they don't work because

225

00:09:08,129 --> 00:09:06,040

they're inconclusive we don't know what

226

00:09:09,809 --> 00:09:08,139

makes that what it's like feeling when

227

00:09:11,789 --> 00:09:09,819

we experience the color red we don't

228

00:09:14,729 --> 00:09:11,799

know neuroscience hasn't figured that

229

00:09:17,220 --> 00:09:14,739

out it may never figure it out but the

230

00:09:18,569 --> 00:09:17,230

fact is because we also can't prove that

231

00:09:20,160 --> 00:09:18,579

it is non penso we can't prove that

232

00:09:23,160 --> 00:09:20,170

neuroscience will never figure it out

233

00:09:25,199 --> 00:09:23,170

it's inconclusive and an inconclusive

234

00:09:27,389 --> 00:09:25,209

argument it's like like the baseball

235

00:09:29,939 --> 00:09:27,399

rule tie goes to the runner if you have

236

00:09:31,710 --> 00:09:29,949

an inconclusive argument inference to

237

00:09:33,869 --> 00:09:31,720

the best explanation throws the argument

238

00:09:35,669 --> 00:09:33,879

of the physicalist because they've won

239

00:09:38,249 --> 00:09:35,679

so many times in the past the odds are

240

00:09:40,769 --> 00:09:38,259

high that we will find at least by their

241

00:09:43,590 --> 00:09:40,779

assessment the odds are very high that

242

00:09:46,019 --> 00:09:43,600

we'll we'll find an explanation within

243

00:09:49,259 --> 00:09:46,029

the physical domain for what its like

244

00:09:51,509 --> 00:09:49,269

the kweli experiences whatever in in

245

00:09:53,069 --> 00:09:51,519

consciousness at least that's of

246

00:09:55,650 --> 00:09:53,079

thinking and as long as you have no